

**New Thoughts on an Old Topic:
Consistency and Inconsistency in Historical Keyboard Fingering**

David Schulenberg (Wagner College and The Juilliard School)

Historical Performance Conference, Indiana University

May 20, 2017

<http://faculty.wagner.edu/david-schulenberg/handouts/>

Publications referred to

Banchieri, Adriano. *Conclusioni nel suono dell'organo*. Bologna: Rossi, 1609. Translated by Lee R. Garrett as *Conclusions for Playing the Organ*. Colorado Springs: Colorado College Music Press, 1982. (See extract below.)

Diruta, Girolamo. *Il Transilvano: Dialogo sopra il vero modo di sonar organi, e i instrumenti da penna*, vol. 1. Venice: Vincenti, 1593 (numerous reprints). Translation by Murray C. Bradshaw and Edward J. Soehrlen as "*The Transylvanian*" (*Il transilvano*). Two volumes. Henryville: Institute of Mediæval Music, 1975. (See extract on last page of this handout.)

Lindley, Mark. "An Introduction to Alessandro Scarlatti's 'Toccatà prima.'" *Early Music* 10 (1982): 333–39.

Vogel, Harald. "Zur Spielweise der Musik für Tasteninstrumente um 1600 / Keyboard Playing Techniques around 1600." In his edition of Samuel Scheidt, *Tabulatura nova*, part 2 (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1999), pp. 145–80.

62

alsignati termini separati, questo vnifono diremmo
deto solo, & di esso pria si vedranno gli suoi mouimen
ti con la mano dritta, poi con la manca, & con tale or
dine giugneremmo fino all'ottaua.

Vnifono nella mano dritta quando saglie per gra
di si principia con il terzo deto mutasi il quarto, poi ri
tornasi di terzo in quarto sin' al fine della diminuta, al
lo scendere si dà principio con il terzo, mutasi con il
secondo poi refumesi di terzo in secondo: Nella mano
manca allo scendere per gradi principiasi con il terzo
deto si seguita con il quarto refumendo di 3. in 4. allo
saglire cominciasi con il 3. seguita il 2. & refumesi
di 3. in 2.

Examples

1. ?Girolamo Frescobaldi (1583–1643), *Toccata seconda* from Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Chigi, Q.IV.25 (“Chigi 25”)

Musical score for measures 75-87 of the *Toccata seconda* by Girolamo Frescobaldi. The score is in G minor, 3/4 time, and consists of five systems of two staves each (treble and bass clef). Measure numbers 75, 78, 81, 84, and 87 are indicated at the start of their respective systems. The music features complex rhythmic patterns, including sixteenth-note runs and various rests.

2. ?Frescobaldi, *Toccata seconda* from Chigi 25, with fingerings and groupings suggested by Diruta and Banchieri

Musical score for measures 75-87 of the *Toccata seconda* by Girolamo Frescobaldi, with fingerings and groupings suggested by Diruta and Banchieri. The score is in G minor, 3/4 time, and consists of two systems of two staves each. The first system (measures 75-77) includes fingerings and groupings: "after Diruta: 1 2 3 4 3 4 3 4" and "after Banchieri (?): 2 3 4 3 4 3 4" for the right hand, and "3 2 3 2 3 2 3" and "2 1 2 1 2 1 2" for the left hand. The second system (measures 78-87) includes fingerings "4" and "5" for the right hand, and "4" and "3" for the left hand. The score ends with a double bar line and repeat signs.

8. William Byrd (1543–1623), “The iij pauian,” BK 14a, from London, British Library, MS Mus. 1591 (My Ladye Nevells Booke)

A musical score for a three-part setting of a pavan. The score is written for three voices (Soprano, Alto, and Tenor) on a grand staff. The key signature has one sharp (F#), and the time signature is common time (C). The music features a mix of eighth and sixteenth notes, with some rests and a final cadence.

9. Byrd, “The galliarde to the same [the third pavan],” BK 14b, from the Nevell book, with possible historical and modern fingerings (beaming of small note values modernized for greater legibility)

A musical score for a galliard, presented in two systems. The key signature has one sharp (F#), and the time signature is 3/4. The score includes fingerings for both historical and modern performance. The first system starts at measure 5, with a bracketed section labeled "[hist.:] 1" and "[mod.:] 1". The second system starts at measure 13. The music is characterized by rapid sixteenth-note passages and a steady bass line.

10. Byrd, keyboard arrangement of John Dowland, Lachrimae Pavan, BK 54, from London, British Library, R.M. 24.d.3 (Will Foster’s Virginal Book), with original fingering (see extract on last page below)

A musical score for a pavan in G minor, BWV 999. The score is written for a single voice on a grand staff. The key signature has two flats (Bb and Eb), and the time signature is common time (C). The music features a series of sixteenth-note runs in the right hand, with a simple accompaniment in the left hand. Fingerings are indicated above the notes.

11. Jan Pieterszoon Sweelinck (1562–1621), Toccata C1, with fingerings from Berlin, Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin–Preußischer Kulturbesitz, Mus. MS Lynar A 1

6

5 4 3 2 1 | 2 1 2 1? | 2 4 3 2

37 3 2 [2 3?] 4 3 2 1

4 3

5 2 3 4 5 4

1 2 3 4

12. Anonymous, *Praeludium ex G*, from Wolfenbüttel, Herzog August Bibliothek, Codex Guelf 1055 (Helmstedt Tabulature, 1641), as given by Vogel, p. 152

3 4 3 2 3 2 3 2 3 2 3 4 3 1 2 3 4 3 4 3 4

2 1 2 3 2 3 2 3 4 3 2 1 4 3 2 1 2 3 2 3 2 3 2 3 4 3 2 1 2 1 2 1

3 4 3 2 3 2 3 2 1 4 3 2 3 2 3 2 3 4 3 4 3 2 3 3 4 3 2

5 1 2 3 2 3 2 3 4 3 2 1 2 1 2 1 2 3 2 3 2 3 2 1 2 1 2 1 1 2 4 5

13. Frescobaldi, *Toccata prima* from *Toccate d'intavolatura . . . Libro P.^o* (Rome: Borbone, 1637), with possible “eclectic” fingerings

The image displays five systems of musical notation for a toccata by Frescobaldi. Each system consists of a grand staff with a treble and bass clef. The music is in common time (C) and features a variety of rhythmic patterns, including sixteenth-note runs and chords. Fingerings are indicated by numbers 1-5 above or below notes. Some notes are marked with a 'b' for breath or a sharp sign for emphasis. Measure numbers 2, 4, 11, 26, and 5 are placed at the beginning of their respective systems. The notation includes slurs, ties, and dynamic markings such as accents and breath marks.

16. Johann Jacob Froberger (1616–67), concluding passages in Toccatas 3, 7, 10, and 12, from the autograph manuscripts Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Mus. Hss. 18706 (“Libro 2”) and 18707 (“Libro 4”)

The image displays five systems of musical notation, each consisting of a grand staff with a treble and bass clef. The first system is in common time (C) and features a complex, flowing melodic line in the treble with a steady eighth-note accompaniment in the bass. The second system begins with a treble clef and a 7/8 time signature, showing a more rhythmic and chordal texture. The third system continues with a treble clef and 7/8 time, featuring a similar rhythmic pattern. The fourth system is in 7/8 time and shows a more intricate melodic development. The fifth system is in common time (C) and features a dense, rapid sixteenth-note texture in both hands, concluding with a final chord. The notation includes various accidentals, slurs, and dynamic markings such as 'p' (piano).

