

David Schulenberg
The Music of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach
Supplement 4.3: Problems of Chronology and Version in Early Works

The first movement of the keyboard sonata in E Minor W. 65/5, whose composition NV places at Frankfurt in 1735, apparently originated as part of a work whose two following movements were later transferred to the sonatas W. 64. The sole source for the early version of the movement might have been copied by a pupil of Emanuel's at Frankfurt.¹ Yet NV lists the sonatas as Leipzig compositions, albeit from 1734, the year Bach left for Frankfurt. This E-minor movement therefore has a status similar to that of the “Solo” in E-flat preserved in P 225, otherwise known as the opening allegro of the Sonata W. 65/7. NV lists the latter as a Frankfurt work of 1736, but in both cases it is possible that individual movements were composed separately, left in rough form until they were later incorporated into complete three-movement sonatas. Only at Frankfurt, perhaps, did Emanuel, now teaching regularly, require works of this sort for his students; following his father's model, he would have polished anything before giving it out. If he did return home for visits during this period, that would help explain the presence of the “Solo” alongside revised versions of one or two other pieces in P 225.²

¹ The manuscript, Hs ND VI 3191, is on paper manufactured at Frankfurt, according to CPEBCW 1/8.2:163–4, which describes this as an “earlier version” of W. 65/5. It is better understood as a distinct work comprising early forms of movements from W. 65/5, 64/2, and 64/4, respectively. For a facsimile of the second movement (identified as Wq 64.4¹¹), see Leisinger and Wollny, “Altes Zeug von mir,” 145.

² The March BWV Anh. 127, whose earlier version appears in CPEBCW 2/8.2 as the second movement of a Suite in E-flat, no. 67 (from another fascicle of the Frankfurt manuscript Hs ND VI 3191); and the Polonaise BWV Anh. 125, probably a later version of the second movement in a sonata from the same source (titled “Suite,” no. 68, in CPEBCW 2/8.2).