

David Schulenberg
The Music of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach
Supplement 3.5: More on the Alternate Scoring of Bach's Trios

The performance of trio sonatas as obligato-keyboard pieces was probably common at Berlin by the 1740s, as witness the copies of six trios by Quantz that were most likely owned by Bach's Berlin colleague Nichelmann.¹ Bach seems to have prepared similar material for some of his own trios around the time of the “renovation” of his Leipzig works of this type (dated 1747 in NV). This material takes the form of autograph obligato-keyboard parts that combine the original flute and bass lines of the Leipzig trios W. 143, W. 145, and 146.² These parts show no signs of correction at points where erasures in the autograph scores (P 357) indicate revisions of small details.³ Hence Bach must have copied these keyboard parts after writing out the “renovated” scores. Yet the absence of many slurs, continuo figures, and other performance markings in the keyboard parts, as well as minor variants in those continuo figures that are present in both scores and parts, suggests that many of these indications were later additions in P 357 or were intentionally omitted from a part intended for a keyboard player. On the other hand, I know of no evidence to support the suggestion that W. 71 and 72 “may have existed in their revised form first as trio sonatas.”⁴ On the contrary, these pieces may have been modeled from the start on Sebastian's sonatas for violin and keyboard.

¹ See the edition of two of them, QV 2:28 and 2:35, in *Johann Joachim Quantz: Seven Trio Sonatas*, edited by Mary Oleskiewicz (Middleton, WI: A-R Editions, 2001). Their sources are among the six manuscripts in the Thelemeier collection whose provenance Schwinger (*Die Musikaliensammlung Thulemeier*, 192–96) describes as “Nichelmann (?)”.

² In B Bc 27904–6; full description and facsimile of the first page of W. 145 in Leisinger and Wollny (*Die Bach-Quellen*, 150–51 and 515–16).

³ E.g., in W. 145, movement 1, measure 51, Bach replaced a rest with a tied sixteenth d" (not noted in the textual commentary of CPEBCW 2/2.1).

⁴ CPEBCW 3/1:xiv, postulating that Bach prepared “renovated” versions of these Leipzig compositions as conventional trio sonatas before rescoring them with obligato keyboard.